

Closing the gap for all ILCOR COSTRs v1.0 approved by CEE 8 April 2019



Closing the gap for all ILCOR COSTRs

Our current system of using publication alerts, domain lead oversight and expertise within the TF to drive new SRs and new COSTR appears to be working towards a steady state based on new evidence and potential to change the COSTR.

**The problem:**

- A. There are many COSTRs that were not GRADE based or have not been updated since 2010 or 2015. It is unlikely that there is new evidence that will change the magnitude or direction of the treatment recommendation. It is likely that values and preferences may need to be updated.
- B. All the 2010 and 2015 COSTRs that currently stand and are used for guidelines need to be uploaded to ILCOR.org as the reference repository and they are not in the correct format nor linked to an SR if one was published.

**A Potential Solution – TMO: Closing the Gap**

- 1. Chairs and TF members sort through all currently cited COSTRs
- 2. Identifies the PICO and EvRev documents associated with the COSTR
- 3. Cross ref them to the current list of PICOs as either retired, reposed or reactivated
- 4. Rerun the search
  - a. TF members look up the old Ev Rev(s) and copies the best /only search strategy
  - b. TF member selects a few key articles (old or new) and runs the search strategy to see if these sentinel papers are identified.
    - i. If yes – perform search going forward from when the last search was performed, and summarize findings in a systematic way:
      - 1. No of hits
      - 2. No of potential new relevant papers (screening level at abstract)
    - ii. If no – request of CEE to hire SMH IT to run search testing against sentinel papers to construct or refine the previous search to ensure the search is working well and perform search going forward from when the last search was performed. TF member takes search and summarizes findings in a systematic way:
      - 1. No of hits
      - 2. No of potential new relevant papers (screening level)

**Comment [LM1]:** CEE approved steps 1-3 to classify the current COSTRs - TF chairs asked for time to complete this task.

Closing the gap for all ILCOR CoSTRs v1.0 approved by CEE 8 April 2019

5. TF member classifies the CoSTRs currently referenced in guidelines into one of three update levels
  - a. **High Priority CoSTR** – Recommendation altering new evidence which may lead to significant change to current CoSTR – **needs an SR as per CEE process - PROSPERO**
  - b. **Low Priority not in GRADE CoSTR** - Some new evidence **but none is recommendation altering** and TF confirms CoSTR is still relevant (relevant pico(s) is/are either reposed or reactivated, citable in guidelines and **not in GRADE format- needs an SR as per CEE process - PROSPERO**
  - c. **Low Priority in GRADE CoSTR update required**– Some new evidence (i.e. all indirect or case series or observational or cohort without a control arm) **but none is recommendation altering** and TF confirms CoSTR is still relevant, citable in guidelines and **is already in GRADE format**– changes to values and preference section now called **EtD highlight section may or may not be required but the GRADE tables need to be updated with the new evidence and the COS needs an update but the treatment recommendation remains unchanged.**
    - Low Priority in GRADE CoSTR process**
      - i. TF runs the search with SMH IT and confirms no of hits, no of potential new relevant papers (screening level)and requests low priority CoSTR approach and submits for CEE review
      - ii. **CEE approves the PICOST** and the approach (low priority PICOST confirmed) and assigns a **CEE rep to the CoSTR and EtD** and sends to ILCOR board and TF chair for acknowledgement=time 0
      - iii. TF updates the CoSTR and EtD and CEE rep is responsible for ensuring **compliance with checklist prior to submission to CEE for approval** and posting on ILCOR.org
      - iv. **CEE reviews and approves CoSTR and EtD and submits to ILCOR.org for posting after ILCOR board approval**
6. Chairs edits the PICO listing with the update level (high, med or low)
7. TF works with chairs to reprioritize the PICO listings based on this additional information.
8. TF prepares PICOST for CEE approval
9. CEE approved PICOST executed as per high, moderate, low priority process
10. CEE process of approval followed
11. CoSTR and EtD are posted on ILCOR.org

## B Potential Solution – CoSTR repository

1. Each TF reviews 2010 and 2015 CoSTR publications and identifies all CoSTRs that are current i.e. the reference standard for current guidelines.
2. TF chair assigns the CoSTR to a willing TF member to reformat into a revised CoSTR template provided by CEE
3. TF member searches for any subsequent published SR where the author lead or senior author was the EvRev for ILCOR.
4. TF works with TF member to update the EtD or build the EtD when applicable
5. Submits CoSTR to CEE for approval with suggested key words to guide placement in the repository
6. CoSTR reviewed by CEE and approved by ILCOR TF to upload to ILCOR.org in a CoSTR repository
7. Each time ILCOR updates the CoSTR on ILCOR.org the previous version is archived.

**Comment [LM2]:** Asking all TF to complete steps 1-3 will enable CEE WG to understand the Cost implications

Essential to provide CEE oversight ensuring quality of the product is the same

All CoSTRs from 2005, 2010 and 2015 are all published in circulation and citable.  
All CoSTRs from 2015 are GRADE only a few are published as SRs  
None of the CoSTRs from 2010 and 2005 are GRADE and only a few are published

GRADE lens would reduce the number of prior neutral recommendations so it is beneficial to put all the CoSTRs currently being cited by guidelines into GRADE with new update dates.

Detailed instruction document – clear the threshold for changing something, no RCTs no controlled studies and no meta required i.e. obs without control and indirect – included in GRADE table

**Comment [LM3]:** Approved as a pilot for one TF

**Comment [LM4]:** Awaiting discussions with digital communications cte

Closing the gap for all ILCOR COSTRs v1.0 approved by CEE 8 April 2019

**Enablers**

1. ILCOR web master develop a searchable repository for all COSTRs
2. All currently updated COSTRs need to be in a searchable repository – ILCOR web master and digital communications issue